LEARNING BRIEF:
Building Evidence of Impact in the After School Sector through Strengthening Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Collaborations

This Learning Brief has been produced by The Learning Trust, in partnership with the Western Cape Government, as a resource for the After School Programme community in the Western Cape (civil society, government and schools). It is the sixth in a series of Learning Briefs, each capturing learning emerging from the Western Cape After School Community of Practice events held in 2016/7.

The 3rd AS CoP Meeting 2017

The 2017 CoP meetings have focused on strengthening the relationships between key stakeholders in the After School (AS) space (NGOs, schools, communities and government) with the aim of developing quality. The third and final meeting for 2017 was held on the 8th of November at The Amy Foundation, and saw 44 NGOs gathering in a safe and interactive space - the largest CoP to date in terms of individual attendees. The meeting sought to explore how the impact of interventions in the AS space can be better evidenced to both garner more support (financial and otherwise) for the sector, as well as develop good practice.

CoP facilitator for the day, Debbie Schkolne from The Learning Trust, welcomed everyone and emphasised how it was an excellent opportunity to learn and share together, with the common goal of improving the quality of the AS space. Forging new connections and networks is an integral part of creating a thriving AS space.
With the help of the below cartoon, Debbie addressed the question “Why MEL?”:

- M&E is vital in the AS space. NGOs need to take the time to stop and reflect in order to see whether or not their work is having the desired effect – this is paramount.
- There is a need for reliable M&E tools – which allows impact to be measured and assessed so that necessary amendments can be made to ASPs (to improve learner outcomes and by extension, garner more support).
- We should be learning from each other to see what works and what has been tried but wasn’t successful. The TEDx talk that Debbie shared by David Dambeger entitled “Learning from Failure” highlights this point.

High-Level Overview From Government

Charline Mouton, Performance Tracking Manager of the Delivery Support Unit in the Department of the Premier and Jacqui Boulle, Chief Director/Programme Manager of the provincial After School Game Changer, presented on “What data the After School Game Changer (ASGC) is collecting and why?” The ASGC has invested quite substantially in an M&E framework and has a clear Theory of Change and a clear set of tools. Jacqui and Charlene outlined for us the ASGC’s approach to M&E. Attached as Annexure 1 you’ll find a valuable pull-out list of definitions of key terms as provided by the ASGC.

1. LEARNER ATTENDANCE AND KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR

When the ASGC began its five year project it had to consider what the one thing was that could be measured that would be universal across all programmes (i.e. sports, arts, life skills or academic support) and that would simultaneously act as a proxy for all the things the ASGC was seeking to accomplish. The answer: Tracking unique learner attendance at AS Programmes (meaning regular and consistent attendance), with a focus on no- and low-fee schools (just over 1,000 schools out of the 1,500 public schools in the province).

A relationship with a caring adult is how a child’s inclination to survive stands the best chance of morphing into to thrive”. Regular contact forms the foundation and subsequent development of such a relationship - a once-off encounter will not allow it to be built or trust to be formed. A learner returning regularly is an indicator that a programme is indeed meeting a need.

“We know that children often come into the world under very trying circumstances and as a result their brains are neurologically hard-wired to survive and not to thrive.”
- Jacqui Boulle
2. MAPPING

In order to provide a clearer picture for all stakeholders regarding coverage, the ASGC has organized the mapping of schools and resources. All the known no- and low-fee schools have been mapped, as well as all the NGOs, partial aftercare sites (both funded and unfunded), peer education MOD centres and neighbourhood schools. This mapping exercise has been captured on the Educollaborate Portal and all NGOs offering service in the AS sector are encouraged to add their details. It is hoped this way that schools that are not being reached by AS services, can be more easily identified and service providers will know which schools to approach.

Visit: https://educcollaborate.westerncape.gov.za/ Also see the update at the end of this learning brief.

3. THE THEORY OF CHANGE

The purpose of a Theory of Change (TOC) is to provide a comprehensive description and illustration of how and why a desired change is expected to happen. The ASGC’s TOC demonstrates the build-up to achieving the KPI of regular and consistent learner participation and the resulting outcomes.

After School Game Changer: Theory of Change (TOC)

If...

Enabling Environment

- Professionalised ASP sector
- Reduced practitioner turn over & suitable practitioner:learner ratio
- Positive learner engagement that builds mastery & skill

Then...

KPI: Regular & Consistent participation

Resulting in...

- Positive Learner outcomes (academic & non academic)
- Reduced learner drop out
- Reduced risky behavior

Note: data sources indicated above not collected at all sites. Teacher & learner survey: 33 ASGC sites
cMY

Acknowledgement: Icons designed by Reepic from Freepik
A range of existing and new DATA TOOLS are used:

Using a range of tools designed with specific extractions in mind allows for a triangulation of findings and a more thorough drawing of conclusions (therefore getting the maximum value out of each of the instruments).

The **KPI data** is tracked through the **Learner Attendance Register** developed by the ASGC, whilst the **Learner Result** is tracked through access to WCD and DCAS data.

**Sampling Strategy in the broader After School Game Changer space:** In order to prove impact, the Delivery Unit has selected **111 sample schools** across the province to provide Learner Survey data as well as Learner Level Performance data at least twice a year until 2019.

**IN SUMMARY:** Tracking unique learner attendance of ASPs (regularly and consistently) is key in the successful and ongoing expansion of the AS Footprint and the ASGC has worked hard to set systems in place in order to determine the impact of the interventions in the ASGC space.

---

**What Else Is Going On In The M&E Space?**

Substantial investment in M&E&L is also happening in the NGO sector and a few organizations shared their learnings and advice in this regard.

**Sam Christie, Director from SAILI** and **Mark Swarts from Green Shoots**, each presented on the topic of “accessing and utilizing data”. The key message was how data can be used by programmes both in and out of school to identify specific needs, to track performance and to **help shape the programme design**.

---

“When you start a new initiative, it’s rare to have all the existing data at your disposal, so you have to develop your own tools that track the particular interventions being implemented.”

– Charline Mouton
SAILI (saili.org.za/website/)

“Sites have to be treated differently and we have to use our data to engage with those sites meaningfully.” – Sam Christie

For the purposes of this presentation SAILI focused in on their work with schools, which looks at what can be done practically to drive improvement in schools using the data that’s already available. SAILI encouraged us to start by focussing on the basics.

Objective: To help schools improve their performance. Schools genuinely want to improve their results yet they lack both objective performance data as well as satisfactory insight into it.

Underlying premise: Having access to performance data (and a better understanding of it) provides valuable insights which lead to focussed improvement strategies being formed and implemented.

Solution: SAILI thus provides schools with performance dashboards and analysis assistance.

VALUABLE LEARNINGS HIGHLIGHTED BY SAILI

- A custom approach for each individual school is critical so as to avoid a “generic effect” – no such thing as a “one-size-fits-all” programme.
- Context needs to be mated with raw, qualitative data.
- Data should essentially be used as a system improvement input.
- Readily available data is cheap and should be used first.
- Named student data is the most potent yet it is largely unavailable.
- Suitable solutions have to be tailored from the information received.
- Existing data needs to be leveraged in a way that allows all kinds of role players to make better decisions about the actions taken.
- Actions generated as a result of NGO input should be documented to allow for cross-pollination across other sites where similar challenges are encountered.
- People who generate data tend not to see it return. Schools are therefore extremely appreciative when data is returned and even more so when it is processed in an honest and constructive way that enables them to improve their approach.

SEMI-AVAILABLE USEFUL DATA SOURCES (school specific):

- Systemic Reports for Grades 3,6 & 9 (provides a maths and language perspective and is a performance pre-dropout indicator)
- National Senior Certificate Summary Report when working with high schools (overview of mark distribution for all subjects for Matrics).
- Grade 8 baselines (although subject to POPI)
- DBE master lists (publically available) – which provides insight into a school’s profile; and
- Find a School (rough cut of a school’s profile).

“We don’t need to overcomplicate... because if we haven’t mined the most basic data, then we haven’t necessarily earned the right to be terribly complicated.” – Sam Christie
Green Shoots (www.greenshootsedu.co.za)

Green Shoots is an example of an NGO that has leveraged the power of back end data linked to e-Resources. Green Shoots spoke to us about its Maths Curriculum Online and Maths@Home programmes.

Green Shoots observed that teachers wanted tools that could help them get real time feedback about learners, to help them monitor an individual learner’s progress, so Maths Curriculum Online was created (an “online exercise book”). Data is extracted weekly and presented in a digestible way to teachers, highlighting where the gaps are with individual learners. In addition to the in-school support, Green Shoots developed an AS model called ‘Maths@Home’. A score card is used to monitor progress which encourages the parent/guardian and centre involvement while also consolidating work covered in school.

VALUABLE LEARNINGS HIGHLIGHTED BY GREENSHOOTS

- Feedback to and engagement with parents is key, they need to see the data and results as well. Through its Maths@Home Programme, learners can continually work on their numeracy outside of the classroom while parents/centres can engage and encourage at this level too.
- The per-learner data generated belongs to the schools. However because they share a common goal, being to improve learner outcomes, Green Shoots have found that schools are often willing to share information.

In the spirit of collaboration, a space was created for further sharing of learnings from those who wanted to share the data collection tools they have developed. Four organisations showcased key monitoring and evaluation tools and methodologies they are utilizing. The roundtable showcasing proved very informative and organisations can be contacted directly for more information on their monitoring tools:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Showcasing:</th>
<th>Website</th>
<th>Contact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afrika Tikkun</td>
<td>M&amp;E tools developed to measure the impact of Child and Youth Development and Empowerment Programmes.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.afrikatikkun.org">www.afrikatikkun.org</a></td>
<td><a href="mailto:info@afrikatikkun.org">info@afrikatikkun.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLICO</td>
<td>M&amp;E tools for Maths Programmes.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.olico.org">www.olico.org</a></td>
<td><a href="mailto:peter@olico.org">peter@olico.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waves for Change</td>
<td>Mobile App Technology for tracking attendance.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.waves-for-change.org">www.waves-for-change.org</a></td>
<td><a href="mailto:matt@isiqalo.org">matt@isiqalo.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young Filmmakers Programme</td>
<td>Using video interview with beneficiaries to evidence impact.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youngfilmmakersprogramme.org.za">www.youngfilmmakersprogramme.org.za</a></td>
<td><a href="mailto:qbfredericks@mweb.co.za">qbfredericks@mweb.co.za</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following link can be used to access the presentation video for sharing: https://www.facebook.com/fairmountyfp/videos/1970392376534097/

Contact: Quinton Fredericks - qbfredericks@mweb.co.za

YFP sends a big thank you to Mr. Curry, an educator at Fairmont High, for his role in supporting the organisation to develop the interviews - real partnerships with schools works!
Delving Deeper

Following the showcasing, the CoP participants split up into three breakaway groups with a view of sharing and learning from each other’s experiences. Each group looked at the data available and identified “gaps” that need to be addressed, as well as how we can collaborate better to evidence impact. Below is an overview of the important conversations that were held.

Academic breakaway group

Facilitators: Charline Mouton (Department of the Premier) and Joy Olivier (Ikamva Youth)

This group tackled what data sharing and collaboration could look like. WCED and NGOs engaged with the aim of stimulating conversation to explore how they can better work together to make data more obtainable, as well as for the department to gain a better understanding of what data NGOs need. To frame the session, Joy Olivier also shared Ikamva Youth’s M&E approach and what data they use and would like to further gain access to.

The WCED are trying to coordinate their data efforts: the first issue they are dealing with is the coordination of the many units and directorates of the WCED that deal with data in order for it to be kept or managed centrally. The second matter is that WCED also want to put a process in place to deal with data queries from external parties. Currently queries are dealt with in an ad hoc manner and WCED are working on a more streamlined process to ensure WCED data is dealt with effectively and safely (from a governance and privacy perspective).

Accessing individual learner data is vital for monitoring quality programming and impact and the recently implemented ‘Protection of Personal Information Act (POPI)’, while valuable, makes this all the more challenging. It was discussed that in some Provinces organizations are using the Data Driven Districts Programme (www.datadrivendistricts.co.za) to work a way around this, however WCED is not using SA SAMS, and so is the only Province not currently on this programme.

The Edu Collaborate site now allows NGOs to access their beneficiaries’ CEMIS numbers, which then allows NGOs to link their learner records to CEMIS numbers which is the number used to also record other learner data in the province (i.e. instead of using the name and surname). The benefit is that through the After School Game Changer (ASGC), learner attendance can be tracked more accurately as one eliminates duplication (same learner attending multiple programmes offered by multiple providers will be picked up on). The ASGC is then able to track data and indicators more effectively across the Province. This is provided that NGOs share their data with the After School Game Changer. The benefit for NGOs in using the CEMIS number system is that all other learner data, if able to be accessed, could be linked using the CEMIS number. This is a more accurate way of linking data than using name and surnames. This benefit will only transpire if NGOs are able to access their beneficiaries’ learner performance, retention, attendance data etc., which was part of the group discussion.

Overall, in weighing in whether and how to share data with external parties, WCED is concerned about the misuse of data so they would need to know that the correct safeguards are in place, this would include signing of agreements, secure data storage programmes, etc. The WCED is working on a system of getting NGOs the data they require but it is a phased process and NGOs were advised it will take time.

WATCH THIS SPACE AS TO A WAY FORWARD

A brainstorming session is to be held on 21 November 2017 with select organisations and WCED in attendance to formally document what data NGOs need from WCED.

“If we are trusted to work with learners, then surely we can be trusted to work with the data.” – Kristen Thompson, Numeric
Non-academic: How are non-academic interventions contributing towards learner wellbeing and improvement?

Facilitators: Matt Mattila & Tim Connibear (on behalf of Action Impact Network) and Christine Downton (The Learning Trust)

This breakaway group set out to look at some of the non-academic outcomes organisations are measuring, the outcome indicators being used (e.g. reduction of risky behaviour), how organisations are measuring these and what tools organisations are using to collect the data (standardised or self-designed?)

Many organizations are trying to measure this impact in a variety of ways and the question is raised as to “how NGOs can collaborate better with one another with regards to M&E, particularly in evidencing impact of learner improvement through non-academic focussed interventions?” Collaboration is critical in building capacity in the sector and building a body of evidence.

Waves for Change shared on their experience and learning through the Impact Action Network (IAN), a consortium of eight international organizations which was formed to establish a collective approach to measuring the impact of programmes delivering mental and wellbeing solutions to at-risk youth, through participation in sport and embodiment activities worldwide. The members of IAN developed a universal theory of change, with identified outcome indicators. Each organisation that is a part of this network is developing, testing and sharing tools to collect data that feeds back into evidencing the theory of change.

IMPORTANT DISCUSSIONS INCLUDED:

✓ Academic outcomes cannot be seen without first framing the value of non-academic outcomes such as emotive indicators displayed by learners (belonging, safety, self-esteem, skill progression and trust).

✓ Something to consider when collecting data, is who is doing the data collection. One needs to weight the value of having a programme staff member versus an external member facilitate the collection of data when measuring learner performance.

“The tools showed us the “belonging” item is crucial, therefore to make learners feel properly engaged is critical.” – Tim Connibear, Waves for Change
Ensuring quality programming

Facilitators: Karl Voysey & Shelly Mogale (AMANDLA EduFootball); Theresa Le Roux and Alice Moyo (Beautiful Gate)

Are programmes being implemented as intended? This breakaway group set out to discuss if NGO’s are monitoring programme quality and implementation, why this is important and what are the different ways in which they are doing this. The group facilitators shared on indicators they are measuring, data collection tools and their challenges and learnings in this space.

IMPORTANT DISCUSSIONS INCLUDED:

- Key to measure what is being done against what was initially intended: understanding the standards that have been set, looking at dosage etc. and then holding those elements against what is actually being done. At the end of the day, does this match the planned action?
- Programme OBSERVATION can help monitor the programme delivery itself to see if it is according to the standards set.
- It is important to not only tracking learner movements and time spent in programmes, but actually being present in sessions to check that delivery is of the desired standard and quality (emphasis on the importance of site monitoring).
- The question surrounding having the capacity to capture data still remains.

NOTE: The above covers what the group discussions included. While no conclusive decisions were arrived at, valuable points were raised and the continuation of further conversations is encouraged.

Lessons And Learnings Around Collaboration

Collectively working towards and evidencing change creates more momentum compared to working in isolation. Waves for Change, as part of the International Surf Therapy Organisation (ISTO), provided us with a good example of the power of what is being achieved through M,E&L collaboration in the surf therapy space.

The Challenge: Get more children into Surf Therapy (there is strong evidence to suggest that getting a child into the water with a caring adult results in great (positive) change in behaviour towards learning).

Utilising Existing Data & Knowledge to Provide a Solution: Instead of concentrating on growing Waves for Change, the focus shifted to how the global wealth of knowledge and practitioners already available could be leveraged to achieve the goal (going the route of a collaborative approach to get more children into the water). Their engagement in ISTO was key in this.

Findings: Surf Therapy looks different around the world but there are some consistent activities and outcomes across the board (for example: some kind of community outreach element, team-building activities and mentor support). These yield similar outcomes such as children experiencing feelings of accomplishment, happiness and confidence, all of which lead to a greater sense of belonging, self-worth and other positive attitudes and behaviours.

The Multiplier Effect in Practice: ISTO created a shared Google document through which every organisation can share its M&E tools, programme tools and evaluation methods - Waves for Change then tapped into this system to achieve its goal in sharing knowledge and information and connecting with other organizations providing surf therapy services. The document means any knowledge that is out there in the Surf Therapy sector is available for free online. To gain access, an organisation simply needs to contribute to the learnings. Through this, it was also identified that there is a need for more experienced organisations to mentor smaller/less capacitated organisations and provide them with support in order to grow.

“if we’re able to bring more people in by sharing our expertise and more and more organisations measuring their impact, then our theory is that all boats rise...” – Tim Connibear, Waves for Change
"The collective power of every organisation sharing their data, sharing their information and mentoring start-ups, that’s how more kids come on board.”
- Tim Connibear, Waves for Change

**IMPORTANT LEARNINGS HIGHLIGHTED BY WAVES FOR CHANGE AND THE ISTO**

- By utilising a **simple system** such as a *shared* Google Doc, important information can be **more readily accessed** and therefore **more easily shared** across organisations with similar goals.
- Essentially there is a **need for the existence/creation** of more **accessible and inexpensive sharing platforms** (this can also help foster a greater sense of **equality** across organisations).
- The **more organisations work together (collaborative approach)**, the **further** the net can be cast, therefore **benefitting higher numbers of those in need**.
- There is a need for larger, more experienced organisations to **mentor/help** smaller organisations and help them grow as part of developing the sector and reaching more beneficiaries with quality services.

**PARTING THOUGHTS**

In order for the After School space to be as effective as possible, **continuous monitoring, evaluation and learning needs to take place**. **Reliable and user-friendly M&E tools are central to achieving this**. The resultant data needs to be **analysed closely** to ensure the necessary amendments take place, which in turn improves learner outcomes. **Sharing of data with the key stakeholders**, i.e. schools, learners, parents and government is strongly encouraged. **In this regard, collaboration is key to strengthening the AS space and the sharing of relevant data and tools plays a vital role in improving the quality of ASPs and reaching more learners.**

Through this COP we have learned that substantial investments are being made by both government and the NGO sector in M,E&L, with both seeking to design programmes and approaches that keep the learners best interest at the forefront. **Progress has been made in collaborations between the two sectors**, but **POPI still presents difficulties when it comes to NGOs obtaining the data they require and finding practical ways of overcoming this is imperative for the AS space to be the best it can be. NGOs are encouraged to participate on the EDUCOLLABORATE Portal and the WCED is in the process of investigating what data is required by the NGO sector and what it can share. This is definitely a space to keep on watching!**
EDUCOLLABORATE PORTAL

This tool is now **LIVE** and all NGOs are encouraged to sign up and add their information. The portal is your gateway to the AS sector in the Western Cape and provides, among other things, a detailed map of all government and non-government ASPs. A verified profile also gives you access to the unique CEMIS learner numbers which help track the impact of your ASP.

Visit [https://educollaborate.westerncape.gov.za](https://educollaborate.westerncape.gov.za), email afterschool@westerncape.gov.za or call William on 021 483 8355.

AFTER SCHOOL ADVANTAGE

A new journal dedicated to exploring and promoting the AS sector. The journal will be published twice a year and is aimed at volunteers, coaches, educators, principals, researchers and anyone else interested or involved in ASPs for K-12 learners. Contributions from anyone with expertise in ASPs are welcome. Send proposals (max 500 words) with a short CV to afterschool@westerncape.gov.za or email Jessica.DuToit@westerncape.gov.za for more information.

THANK YOU FOR PARTNERING WITH US!

A very big thank you to the following people for participating in and contributing to the COP:

**Charline Mouton** - Performance Tracking Manager of the Delivery Support Unit in the Department of the Premier
**Sam Christie** – SAILI
**Mark Swarts** – Green Shoots
**Peter Wächtler** – OLICO
**Nicci van der Merwe, Matt Mattila & Tim Connibear** – Waves for Change
**Quinton Fredericks** – Young Filmmakers Programme
**Joy Olivier** – IkamvaYouth
**Theresa Le Roux and Alice Moyo** – Beautiful Gate
**Karl Voysey and Shelley Mogale** – AMANDLA EduFootball

We are grateful to all the representatives of the following organisations who participated in the third After School Community of Practice meeting of 2017:

The Learning Trust is a non-profit, conduit funding organisation that seeks to extend and improve learning opportunities for young South Africans growing up in conditions of poverty and exclusion, by funding and building the capacity of outstanding, emerging grassroots education initiatives. The Learning Trust works alongside local partners to strengthen governance and improve quality and impact. With a portfolio of more than 60 grantee partners, many of which offer After School Programmes (ASPs), The Learning Trust seeks to support the coordination of the After School sector in South Africa. It has been appointed as the Western Cape Government’s partner in facilitating this, by building a community of NGO stakeholders interested in collaborating to grow the sector in the Western Cape.

The After School Game Changer initiative was launched by the Western Cape Government in 2015, to strengthen After School Programmes and the outcomes of the sector for disadvantaged and disengaged youth. The goal is:

Western Cape learners’ regular and sustained participation in after school activities which contributes towards positive youth development and improves school outcomes.

The After School space was selected as one of the province’s key priorities – or game changers – as it provides safe and supervised spaces, holistic education, a sense of belonging and positive role models, all of which the province aims to enable through its game changers. The target is 112 00 learners in regular and consistent programmes by 2019 (20% of learners in no- and low-fee schools). The Western Cape Government aims to achieve this by working with all the stakeholders in the sector either directly or via partnerships.
IMPORTANT DEFINITIONS PROVIDED BY THE ASGC:

- **After School Programme**: Programmes that run at the end of the WCED teaching day (excludes break-time programmes and holiday activities).
- **No- or low-fee school**: Any school where the fees are less than R100 a month.
- **Learners**: Focus on individual learners so as to make the large volume of data being handled more valuable (example: “data revealed 49 000 children are playing sport, but that does not tell who is playing which sport where”).

Individual learners are tracked by their CEMIS number, a unique identifier that includes date of birth, initials and sex. A school will ensure every learner has one (the school subsidy is based on this number).

- **Regular and consistent**: The ASGC is defining this as essentially a proxy for quality.
- **Regular**: At least TWICE a week.
- **Consistent**: Sustained throughout the year – 70% of the available time. If consistency is not maintained, it can be problematic because:

  - It is harder to keep youth safe and deliver positive alternatives to many of the risk-taking behaviours.
  - It indicates learners have not been “hooked in” and will therefore not be exposed to the opportunities needed to help them find their passion (passion often leads to investment and commitment, and a higher likelihood of pursuing something meaningful).

- **Hours**: Ideally learners should be getting at least one hour of programming, with a targeted dosage of three hours per week. This is considered adequate time to build a relationship and nurture the dream/passion.

- **Quality programming**: The ASGC are using the following set of standards to determine quality:

  - **Diverse offering across four pillars (sports, arts, academic & life skills)** – a range of different programmes offered catering for a range of different learners (a school qualifies as a viable site for an ASP if it offers at least two different activities per pillar and academic programme).

  - **Intentional programme**
  - **Proper management systems in place** (includes tracking systems)
  - **Quality human resources**
  - **Creation of a safe environment** (physically and psychologically); and
  - **Engagement with the school and the broader community.**